

On Frequency-based Approaches to Learning Stopwords and the Reliability of Existing Resources A Study on Italian Language

Stefano Ferilli, Floriana Esposito

Dipartimento di Informatica - Università di Bari, Bari, Italy

stefano.ferilli@uniba.it



Overview

- Introduction & Motivation
- Current Landscape & Objectives
- Proposed Approach
- Quantitative & Qualitative Evaluation
- Conclusions & Future Work

Introduction

- Most DL content is text
- NLP techniques of utmost importance for the proper management of DLs
- Based on language-specific linguistic resources
- Might be unavailable for many languages
- Manual compilation costly, time-consuming and error-prone
- Desirable to learn these resources automatically
- Often no prior knowledge about the language

Background

- BLA-BLA tool
 - Broad-spectrum Language Analysis-Based Learning Application
- Fully automatic learning of linguistic resources from plain text(s) in a given language
 - Language identification
 - Stopword removal
 - Term normalization
 - Concept extraction
- Works on very small corpora
- General approaches applicable to any language
 - Terms from other languages = Noise

Focus

- Stopwords
 - Terms that are not necessary to understand the topic and content of a document
 - Appear often and pervasively
 - Have the same likelihood of occurring in documents not relevant to a query as in those relevant to the query [IR]
 - By definition, can be safely ignored by NLP techniques that work at the lexical level
 - Removal task simply carried out by look-up in a pre-determined list of words

Basics

- Stopword removal
 - Early step in NLP pipeline
 - May affect the performance of subsequent steps
- Stopword Lists
 - Function words
 - Terms associated to invariant Parts-of-Speech of the language (usually articles, pronouns and prepositions)
 - Requires prior knowledge about the grammar of the language
 - Frequent terms
 - Domain-specific terms in domain-specific applications

Current Landscape

- Past approaches to learning stopword lists
 - Vector Space Model
 - Based on Porter's stemmer
 - Language-dependent
 - Requires language-specific tools/resources
 - Purely frequency-based approaches
 - Deal with specific languages
 - English, French
 - Million words corpora
 - Manual adjustment of the learned list of stopwords
- Benchmark stopword lists (freely) available

Objectives

- Experimental study on frequency behavior of words
 - Assessment of quality and reliability of existing resources
- Technique for automatic support to stopword list compilation
 - Language-independence
 - May be used for non-widespread languages (e.g., dialects)
 - Small training data
 - Quality of the results for increasingly larger data
 - Different ages and styles

Proposed Approach

- Very simple
 - Extract multiset W of words in the corpus
 - V “vocabulary” (the set of different words in W)
 - Compute relative frequency of each word $w \in W$
 - $f(w) = |w|/|W|$
 - Ratio of number of occurrences of the word over the overall number of word occurrences in the text(s)
 - Rank members of V by decreasing frequency
 - Consider the set S of all words $v \in V$ for which $f(v) \geq f'$ for a frequency threshold f'
 - Check for stopwords in S

Experimental Setting

- Word
 - Sequence of alphabetic characters only, delimited by blank spaces or punctuation
 - Apostrophe joining two words was considered as well
 - Formally defined by the linear expression pattern:
 - $b P \{ W' \}^* W P b$
 - b the blank symbol
 - $'$ the apostrophe
 - $P = \{ ., |, ;, : | ? | ! | " | ' \}^*$ (possibly empty) sequence of punctuation marks
 - $W = \{ a | b | \dots | z \}^+$ word (hypothesizing a latin alphabet)

Experimental Setting

- Italian language
 - Has attracted some attention from the NLP community
 - Existing stopwords lists may serve as a golden standard
 - Less studied than English
 - Existing resources may be less refined
 - More complex structure than English
 - Experimental results should apply to most other languages, as well
- Small training corpus
 - Stress the proposed approach
 - In large corpora the frequency of real stopwords is clearly predominant
 - For some languages (e.g., dialects) only very few written texts are available

Training Corpus

- 10 texts
 - Project Gutenberg and Liber Liber repositories
 - Make freely available many well-known texts from the literature of several languages
 - Obtained by applying OCR to books, and so they contain spelling errors spread through the text
 - Allows us to test our approach on noisy data, which are what one may expect to have in real-world settings
 - Wide range of styles
 - 2 “technical”
 - Poetry, Legal
 - 3 “non-technical”
 - Novels, Stories, Travel accounts

Training Corpus

- Texts

- La Divina Commedia, poem, XIV century
- Codice Civile, technical text, XX century
- L'Esclusa, novel, 2nd half of XIX century
- I Promessi Sposi, novel, 1st half of XIX century
- Tutte le novelle, collection of stories, XIX-XX centuries
- Passeggiate per l'Italia, description of travels, XIX century

- Golden Standard

- Stopword list provided by Snowball
 - Well-known tool exploited by many systems
 - 279 stopwords (complete form)

Training Corpus

- Statistics
 - Length (number of characters and of words)
 - Approximate (counted by a text editor)
 - Linguistic variety (number of words in 'Vocabulary')
 - Exact (computed by the pre-processing step)

#	Text	Chars	Words	Vocabulary
1	La Divina Commedia	561149	97714	12796
2	Codice Civile	1511666	228251	8659
3	L'Esclusa	337589	55846	8919
4	I Promessi Sposi	1307423	220174	19658
5	Tutte le novelle	1591823	264703	21641
6	Passeggiate per l'Italia 1	438868	71467	11995
7	Passeggiate per l'Italia 2	549884	86818	14710
8	Passeggiate per l'Italia 3	478110	75871	12721
9	Passeggiate per l'Italia 4	472272	75618	12183
10	Passeggiate per l'Italia 5	289006	46655	10470
11	Passeggiate per l'Italia	2228140	356429	30855

Performance Evaluation

- Measures

- $P@n$: Precision of the top n items in the ranking
 - % of items that are also in the golden standard
 - $n = 100$ delimits a 'safety region' including (almost) only stopwords
- $P = 1$: maximum position in the ranking at which 100% precision is preserved
 - Indication of how reliable is the top of the ranking
- $R@100$: recall at position 100
 - Compared to $P@100$ gives an idea of how much of the golden standard is still missing at that point in the list
 - Maximum recall reachable @100 is $100/279 = 0.36$
- $P=R@279$: performance at position 279
 - At this position, precision and recall take the same value ($P=R$)

Experimental Results

- Single text (#) and Relevant aggregates of texts
 - ‘6-10’ = the whole ‘Passeggiate per l'Italia’
 - ‘All’ = the whole set of texts
 - ‘N-T’ = non-technical texts only

Text(s) #	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	6-10	All	N-T
P@10	1.0	0.9	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0
P@20	0.85	0.95	0.95	0.95	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0
P@30	0.83	0.87	0.93	0.90	1.0	1.0	0.97	0.93	1.0	1.0	0.97	0.97	0.97
P@40	0.80	0.88	0.85	0.85	0.90	0.95	0.95	0.93	0.93	0.93	0.95	0.95	0.95
P@50	0.74	0.76	0.72	0.80	0.90	0.94	0.92	0.90	0.88	0.92	0.94	0.90	0.90
P@60	0.67	0.68	0.70	0.73	0.85	0.88	0.87	0.90	0.83	0.88	0.90	0.88	0.87
P@70	0.64	0.61	0.69	0.73	0.77	0.83	0.81	0.83	0.81	0.81	0.86	0.83	0.86
P@80	0.60	0.58	0.70	0.70	0.69	0.79	0.76	0.75	0.79	0.76	0.83	0.80	0.81
P@90	0.58	0.54	0.66	0.67	0.66	0.73	0.73	0.73	0.76	0.71	0.78	0.74	0.76
P@100	0.53	0.53	0.62	0.65	0.62	0.73	0.71	0.68	0.71	0.66	0.72	0.72	0.72
P = 1	11	5	14	14	30	33	27	21	33	30	28	27	25
R@100	0.19	0.19	0.22	0.23	0.22	0.26	0.25	0.24	0.25	0.24	0.26	0.26	0.26
P=R@279	0.32	0.28	0.35	0.38	0.38	0.36	0.36	0.36	0.34	0.36	0.37	0.40	0.41

Discussion about Performance

- More related to writing style than to length
 - Makes sense but partly unexpected
 - Colloquial styles more useful than technical ones
 - Best on journalistic ('Passeggiate per l'Italia')
 - Still quite high on stories ('Tutte le novelle')
 - novels come immediately after
 - Lower on the texts written using more particular styles
 - 'Codice Civile' (technical) and 'La Divina Commedia' (poetry)
- Using many texts improves performance (expected)
 - improvement not outstanding compared to some single texts, especially for the upper part of the ranking, a smoother decay in performance is clearly visible, as confirmed by the neat increase in performance @279.

Detailed Results

- Single texts

La Divina Commedia ch sì de d s quel me poi così m là quando già tanto son
altro qual occhi ben disse sé lor qui ché or fa né com vidi n ogne elli pur però
esser ciò giù altra tal prima ancor poco mondo te sù onde mai;

Codice Civile art può essere seguenti deve diritto cod contratto società caso
civ beni disposizioni quando stato atto comma cosa parte secondo termine
d possono salvo diritti codice legge titolo att devono altri azioni senza norme
atti creditore fondo debitore terzo proc ogni valore parti luogo amministratori
n persona;

L'Esclusa marta d s così occhi madre ora maria quasi no poi me quel sì via due
casa signora egli dopo senza anna rocco alvignani ella marito mano ancora
qua sotto ogni ah prima già disse giorno mani nulla;

I Promessi Sposi d quel s così disse poi renzo cosa de altro due qualche quando
ora don senza ogni far lucia fatto parte tempo tanto bene gran qui ch altri
casa fare dire uomo sempre già dopo;

Tutte le novelle d occhi quel quando senza altro poi ora fra due ella s casa
tanto colle colla sotto ogni disse così cosa mani fatto prima egli capo dopo
mano sempre tutta giorno dietro nulla quasi volta ancora né;

Detailed Results

- Single texts

Passeggiate per l'Italia 1 d città roma *ancora* qui mare castello fra monti s due quando dopo *ora* tempo quasi così perchè campagna poi parte chiesa là strada prima ogni *stato*;

Passeggiate per l'Italia 2 roma d ebrei città chiesa impero tempo s due fra così quando sotto grande *ancora ora* storia tevere ogni parte *stato* già popolo egli quel essa dopo italia papa;

Passeggiate per l'Italia 3 roma d egli città italia così parte tempo *ancora* fra *stato* grande napoleone dopo s ravenna francia due papa essi solo già chiesa avignone *ora* romani quali storia senza quando garibaldi essere;

Passeggiate per l'Italia 4 d napoli città isola s due re mare sicilia quali tutte ogni così dopo fra popolo parte tutta *ancora* capri sotto senza palermo pure grande quasi quando siracusa quel;

Passeggiate per l'Italia 5 così d città s *ora* mare quando arte egli tempo vita perchè sempre già solo *ancora* sicilia intorno ciò due ogni casa tempio cuore allora essa dopo arrio popolo mentre euforione amore verso pompei;

Detailed Results

- Relevant aggregates of texts

Passeggiate per l'Italia d roma città così s due fra *ancora* tempo egli quando dopo *ora* parte ogni chiesa grande sotto mare quali italia *stato* già qui quel tutte solo senza;

Whole corpus d art s quel quando così può due poi senza altro essere cosa ogni *ora* ch parte tempo dopo prima *stato* occhi disse de tanto altri fatto sì;

Non-technical texts d quel s così quando due poi *ora* senza altro ogni dopo tempo cosa disse *ancora* città tanto egli casa fra prima sempre sotto fatto roma parte.

Evaluation of the Golden Standard

- Missing stopwords
 - Many words in the list that we would safely consider as stopwords are not in the golden standard
 - The absence of some is really strange
 - Many pronouns and generic adverbs (but other similar pronouns or generic adverbs are)
 - Essere (but many inflected form are)
 - Fra (but 'tra' is)
 - Etc.
- Conclusions
 - Albeit Italian is a language that received significant attention, the available resources are not reliable

Beyond the Golden Standard

- Re-compute performance
 - Stopwords = all words that do not have a definite meaning by themselves
 - Articles, pronouns, conjunctions and prepositions
 - Some adverbs and some verbs (e.g., modal verbs)
 - Some words are ambiguous
 - Stopwords or not depending on interpretation
 - *stato*: noun (non-stopword) or past participle (stopword)?
 - *colla*: 'glue' (non-stopword) or contraction of `con la' (stopword)?
 - *colle*: 'hill' (non-stopword) or contraction of `con le' (stopword)?
 - *ancora*: 'anchor' (non-stopword) or `still, again' (stopword)?
 - *ora*: 'hour' (non-stopword) or `now' (stopword)?
 - ...

Adjusted Evaluation

- Measure
 - Count & P@100
- 2 settings
 - Strict: does not consider ambiguous terms as stopwords
 - Loose: considers ambiguous terms as stopwords

Text(s)	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	6-10	All	N-T
Original	0.53	0.53	0.62	0.65	0.62	0.73	0.71	0.68	0.71	0.66	0.72	0.72	0.72
Loose	4	30	14	10	7	10	13	15	12	14	8	5	7
P@100	0.96	0.70	0.86	0.90	0.93	0.90	0.87	0.85	0.88	0.86	0.92	0.95	0.93
Strict	0	1	2	1	4	3	3	3	1	2	3	2	2
P@100	0.96	0.69	0.84	0.89	0.89	0.87	0.84	0.82	0.87	0.84	0.89	0.93	0.91

Further Considerations

- Texts perspective:
 - Poem includes many stopwords in truncated form
 - Considering them as correct stopwords would make this text the best one, instead of the worst
 - Technical text includes many specific words
 - Misses many stopwords, because they are seldom used in the specific domain
 - Still the worst, even after the corrections are applied
 - Together with non-technical texts improves performance
 - After corrections, novels become the best-performing non-technical single texts
 - Same 'strict' performance as the 'journalistic' text(s)
 - Even better than them in the loose setting

Further Considerations

- Terms/Stopwords perspective:
 - Using sets of texts wrong terms are pushed towards the end of the list
 - Larger corpora improve the quality of the results
 - Some terms might be considered as stopwords even if missing in the golden standard
 - Terms appearing in all lists
 - E.g., *d*, a truncation of preposition *di*
 - Terms appearing in the majority of lists
 - quando, così, dopo, due, ogni, ora, ancora, già, parte, quel, senza
 - Terms appearing in almost all lists
 - E.g., ‘ora’ and ‘ancora’

Further Perspectives

- Consider terms in the ranking that are not stopwords

La Divina Commedia altra ancor ben ché ciò com elli esser fa già gi lor là m
mai me mondo n né ogne onde or per poco pur qual qui son s s tal te vidi;

Codice Civile amministratori att atti atto azioni beni caso civ cod codice
comma contratto creditore debitore deve devono diritti diritto disposizioni
fondo legge luogo n norme parti persona possono proc salvo secondo seguenti
società termine terzo titolo valore;

L'Esclusa ah alvignani ancora anna casa egli ella giorno già madre mani mano
maria marito marta me no nulla qua quasi rocco signora sotto via;

I Promessi Sposi bene casa dire don far fare già gran lucia qualche qui renzo
sempre uomo;

Tutte le novelle ancora capo casa colla colle dietro egli ella fra giorno mani
mano nulla né quasi sempre sotto tutta volta;

Further Perspectives

- Consider terms in the ranking that are not stopwords

Passeggiate per l'Italia 1 ancora campagna castello chiesa città fra là mare
monti perchè quasi qui roma strada;

Passeggiate per l'Italia 2 ancora chiesa città ebrei egli essa fra già grande
impero italia papa popolo roma sotto storia tevere;

Passeggiate per l'Italia 3 ancora avignone chiesa città egli essi fra francia
garibaldi già grande italia napoleone papa quali ravenna roma romani solo
storia;

Passeggiate per l'Italia 4 ancora capri città fra grande isola mare napoli
palermo popolo pure quali quasi re sicilia siracusa sotto tutta tutte;

Passeggiate per l'Italia 5 allora amore ancora arrio arte casa città ci cuore
egli essa euforione già intorno mare mentre perch pompeii popolo sempre
sicilia solo tempio verso vita;

Passeggiate per l'Italia ancora chiesa città egli fra già grande italia mare
quali qui roma solo sotto tutte.

Considerations

- Non-stopwords might act as keywords
 - Reading them one may infer that
 - ‘La divina commedia’ is a poem due to the presence of many truncated words
 - ‘Codice Civile’ is about regulations and agreements among people
 - ‘I Promessi Sposi’ and ‘L'esclusa’ are novels, due to the presence of persons' nouns (their main characters are clearly highlighted)
 - In particular, L'Esclusa is about family relationships
 - Passeggiate per l'Italia is about geography/landscape, history/politics and art
 - First three volumes concern Rome
 - Last two concern the Reign of the Two Sicilies

Proposal

- Extending BLABLA
 - Improving stopword extraction feature
 - Adding a keyword extraction feature
- Given a set of texts
 - Extract candidate stopwords using the frequency-based approach
 - One text: domain-specific terms in the list might be considered as domain-specific stopwords, according to the literature
 - Compare the stopwords extracted from the complete corpus to the stopwords extracted from the single texts
 - May be used both to identify real stopwords and to extract keywords describing the specific content of the single texts

Conclusions

- Studied the behavior of frequent words in single texts and (small) corpora
- Proposed, based on the study, a methodology to automatically learn stopwords lists from texts
 - Also relevant keywords may be extracted with a little extension of the proposed approach
- Preliminary experimental results
 - show that the extracted stopwords and keywords are appropriate
 - pointed out deficiencies of standard resources available in the literature

Future Work

- Define an approach to determine the threshold at which distinguishing stopwords from non-stopwords
- Study of the behavior on larger and more varied corpora
- Indirect evaluation of the quality of results through the performance of high-level NLP tasks based on the learned resources